

MARK SCHEME for the May/June 2008 question paper

9697 HISTORY

9697/06

Paper 6, maximum raw mark 100

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began.

All Examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes must be read in conjunction with the question papers and the report on the examination.

- CIE will not enter into discussions or correspondence in connection with these mark schemes.

CIE is publishing the mark schemes for the May/June 2008 question papers for most IGCSE, GCE Advanced Level and Advanced Subsidiary Level syllabuses and some Ordinary Level syllabuses.

Page 2	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

GENERIC MARK BANDS FOR ESSAY QUESTIONS

Examiners will assess which marking band best reflects the quality of the answer. They should expect answers to show all the qualities included within the band description. The choice of marks within the band will depend on the quality of the analysis and the amount of supporting information. Essays in Bands 1–3 will clearly be question-focused, whereas answers in lower bands will show a primary concern with the topic rather than with the specific question asked. However, a question focus is not sufficient in itself to place an essay in Bands 1-3; this must also be accompanied by sufficient accurate, relevant supporting material.

Band Mark Quality of the answer

- 1 21–25 The approach will be consistently analytical or explanatory rather than descriptive or narrative. Essays will be fully relevant. The argument will be structured coherently and supported by very appropriate factual material. The writing will be accurate. At the lower end of the band, there may be some weaker sections to the answer, but the overall quality will show that the candidate is in control of the argument. The best answers must be awarded 25 marks.
- 2 18–20 Essays will be focused clearly on the demands of the question but there will be some unevenness. The approach will be mostly analytical or explanatory rather than descriptive or narrative. The answer will be mostly relevant. Most of the argument will be structured coherently and supported by largely accurate factual material. The impression will be that a good solid answer has been provided. The writing will be mostly accurate.
- 3 16–17 Essays will reflect a clear understanding of the question, and constitute a fair attempt to provide an argument and factual knowledge to answer it. The approach will contain analysis or explanation, but there may be some heavily narrative or descriptive passages. The answer will be largely relevant. Essays will achieve a genuine argument but may lack balance and depth in factual knowledge. Most of the answer will be structured satisfactorily but some parts may lack full coherence. The writing will be generally accurate.
- 4 14–15 Essays will indicate attempts to argue relevantly, though often only implicitly. The approach will depend more on some heavily descriptive or narrative passages than on analysis or explanation, which may be limited to introductions and conclusions. Factual material, sometimes very full, will be used to impart information or describe events rather than to address directly the requirements of the question. The structure of the argument could be more organised more effectively. The writing will usually be accurate.
- 5 11–13 Essays will offer some appropriate elements but there will be little attempt generally to link factual material to the demands of the question. The approach will lack analysis and the quality of the description or narrative, although sufficiently accurate and relevant to the topic if not the particular question, will not be linked effectively to the argument. The structure will show weaknesses and the treatment of topics within the answer will be unbalanced. The writing may show some accuracy but there will also be frequent errors.
- 6 8–10 Essays will not be properly focused on the requirements of the question. There may be many unsupported assertions and commentaries which lack sufficient factual support. The argument may be of limited relevance to the topic and there may be confusion about the implications of the question. The writing will show significant weaknesses.
- 7 0–7 Essays will be characterised by significant irrelevance or arguments that do not begin to make significant points. The answers may be largely fragmentary and incoherent. The writing will show very significant weakness. Marks at the bottom of this band will be given very rarely because even the most wayward and fragmentary answers usually make at least a few valid points.

Page 3	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

1 EMANCIPATION IN THE BRITISH WEST INDIES

'It was the actions of the slaves themselves which dictated the passage of the British Emancipation Act.' How far does the evidence of Sources A–E support this statement?

L1 WRITES ABOUT THE HYPOTHESIS, NO SOURCE USE [1-5]

[Use of the sources involves identification of the source by letter or a direct quote in order to test the hypothesis. Merely writing about issues covered by the sources is not source use.]

Answers will be about the passage of the Act but ignore the terms of the question by not using the sources as information or evidence to test the hypothesis. Include in this level answers which use information taken from the sources but only in producing a general account, without direct reference to the sources.

L2 USES INFORMATION TAKEN FROM THE SOURCES TO CHALLENGE OR SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS [6-8]

These answers use the sources as information rather than as evidence i.e. sources are used at face value only with no evaluation/interpretation in context.

Disagrees with the hypothesis using Sources B and D. Possible use of Source E too (preventing violence).

OR

Agrees with the hypothesis using Sources A, C and E (on threat of violence).

L3 USES INFORMATION TAKEN FROM THE SOURCES TO CHALLENGE AND SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS [9-13]

Both aspects of Level 2

L4 BY INTERPRETING/EVALUATING SOURCES IN CONTEXT FINDS EVIDENCE TO CHALLENGE OR SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS [14-16]

SUPPORT can be found in Sources A and C which both purport to record the views/aspirations of the slaves whose position is not often stated first hand. Source A is from an unexpected, exasperated source in Jamaica and refers to context of Jamaica revolt. Source C expresses urgency and backs up much of Source A. Both are in a position to know as residents in the Caribbean and both might have been expected to be unconcerned about the situation of the slaves etc. Sources B and E refer to the threat of bloodshed too, suggesting the situation was widely appreciated.

CHALLENGE mainly in B and D, but possibly in E as well. The dates used stress that just before the Emancipation Act was passed there was a different factor, that of the campaign within Britain, apparently in the case of D having a clear connection with the government's position on ending slavery. Source B is contemporary, Source D secondary, opening the question of context and support for each other. Source E shows planters jumping on the bandwagon, as a further alternative view of the timing of emancipation.

Page 4	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

L5 BY INTERPRETING/EVALUATING SOURCES IN CONTEXT FINDS EVIDENCE TO CHALLENGE AND SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS

These answers demonstrate understanding that testing a hypothesis involves attempting to confirm and challenge the hypothesis and are capable of using sources as evidence to do this (both confirmation and opposition are done at this level).

Given this topic and selection of sources, it may be that the weight of many answers may be in support of the hypothesis. Judge answers as a whole even if the introduction or conclusion appears to be one sided so that due credit is given.

L6 as LEVEL 5 AND

(A) EXPLAINS WHY EVIDENCE TO CHALLENGE OR SUPPORT IS BETTER/PREFERRED (I.E. A COMPARATIVE JUDGEMENT ON WHY SOME EVIDENCE IS BETTER AND SOME EVIDENCE IS WORSE).

OR

(B) RECONCILES/EXPLAINS PROBLEMS IN THE EVIDENCE TO SHOW THAT NEITHER CHALLENGE NOR SUPPORT IS TO BE PREFERRED. [22-25]

Note that this level builds an extra element into what is expected at Level 5.

For (a) the argument must be that the evidence for challenging/supporting is better/preferred i.e. not just that some evidence is better but also why some is worse.

For (b) responses include all Level 5 answers which use evidence to modify the hypothesis (rather than only seeking to support or contradict) in order to improve it e.g. that there were multiple causes which happened to coalesce around the reforming nature of the 1830s.

Page 5	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

2 Explain the factors which brought about the complete emancipation of slaves from 1868 to 1886.

Background: by 1860 slave population in Cuba c. 370 000 (already reducing as proportion of total population, 44% in 1840s: 27% in 1869). Slave Trade largely blocked (importation of Chinese). Nationalists favoured emancipation. Planters not sure that free people would perform plantation tasks.

Ten Years War affected the future of slavery (1868–78)

- 1 Insurgents declared qualified freedom for slaves; to gain support.
- 2 Spain hoped to take moral high ground – 1870 Moret Law. Freed children born since 1868 and slaves over 60. Little effect on those of working age.
- 3 1878 Treaty of Zanjón – slaves who fought on either side freed.
- 4 1879 slaves in the East refused to work unless freed too.
- 5 Spanish government pressed by abolitionists to end slavery.

Patronato 1880–1888

- 1 Decree ending slavery Feb 1880 set out details of system – including gradual release of patrocinados from 1885.
- 2 Attacked by abolitionists and undermined by masters and apprentices, ended prematurely 1886 (1883–4 26,000 freed).

The decay of slavery

- 1 Decay varied, main sugar areas showed greatest persistence of slavery. Numbers of slaves in 1862 370 000, 1883 100 000, 1886 25 000.
- 2 Remained strongest in technologically advanced areas: declined most elsewhere. Though diminishing, slave labour remained important.
- 3 Working population boosted by Chinese and other immigrants. Slaves who died not replaced, purchase of freedom more common. Total fell from 1877 200,000 to 1883 100,000.

Attitude of Planters

- 1 Observer in 1873 stated that planters were convinced of the need for manumission but not convinced of the wisdom of any measure to end slavery.
- 2 1879: appear to have remained attached to the control that slavery gave them over the work force. In 1880 the government abolished the name while keeping much of the substance.
- 3 Slavery was not incompatible with advanced technology.

Page 6	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

3 Examine the aims of the Apprenticeship scheme in the British Caribbean and as effectively it worked.

Purposes

- 1 It assumed the continuation of the sugar plantation system.
- 2 To provide an easy and peaceful transition from slavery to freedom.
- 3 To give planters an adequate supply of labour while it lasted.
- 4 To train apprentices for the responsibilities of freedom, especially in working regularly for wages.
etc.

Flaws in scheme

- 1 It was neither full freedom, nor full slavery.
- 2 Details of scheme favoured planters. Institution of stipendiary magistrates as balancing element didn't really work.

The working of Apprenticeship

- 1 Not all aspects were failures – no evidence that estates suffered from lack of labour. Sugar production continued in a time of decline and depression. Apprenticeship made decline less acute.
- 2 Worked better in some islands and even in different parts of some islands.
- 3 From the point of view of apprentices, the apprenticeship scheme was nothing but a modified slavery and they did not have full bargaining power with planters. The planters' control within the plantations allowed for abuses of the system which attracted the attention of antislavery groups in Britain.
- 4 There was little improvement in social conditions though some provision was made for education.
- 5 Stipendiary Magistrates appointed to prevent administration of apprenticeship falling into the hands of former slave owners. They were expected to administer justice and preserve law and order. They also had other duties – visiting estates. Though some were conscientious and even-handed, there were serious flaws in the effectiveness of these intermediaries.
- 6 There were many examples of how planters exploited the system in detail and undermined the effectiveness of the magistrates.
- 7 British abolitionists began to protest about abuses as early as 1835. The continued campaign was one of the factors in the premature ending of apprenticeship. Local Assemblies acted in 1838, some planters thought the ending would provide benefits and there were concerns about the reactions of those who would not be fully free until 1840.

Page 7	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

4 Discuss the nature and extent of the movement away from estates after the abolition of slavery in the British and French Caribbean.

Introductions could include (1) historians have disagreed about explanations (2) was there a sudden exodus or a gradual process? (3) 'A combination of factors explains the ex-slaves' desire to leave the estates after emancipation'.

Various explanations

- 1 An immediate exodus – fleeing the hated plantation and memories of slavery. There was some movement (e.g. French colonies) but this explanation has been largely dismissed as a major explanation. Many historians use the idea of revulsion as one factor (desire to leave counter balanced by desire to live on plantation village with provision grounds). NB many former slaves continued to live and work on estates.
- 2 Planters' attitudes as a push factor, based on reactions to emancipation and desire to retain a regular work force. Use of coercive measures and rent/wage issues. It has been suggested that many would have stayed on estates had they had security of tenure, fair wages etc. (e.g. British Guiana).
- 3 Linking 1 and 2, the emancipated had an opportunity to realise the significance of emancipation individually, move to seek the advantages of peasantry or other employment, choices concerning labour, free villages etc.
- 4 Movement off the estates depended on somewhere to go – crown lands, availability of affordable land. Lack of opportunities (St. Kitts, Antigua, Barbados) though some emigration to high wage colonies (Trinidad) and more opportunities.
- 5 Scale and rapidity of movement can be exaggerated. In British Guiana where land was available in the interior there is no evidence to support the view that ex-slaves rushed from the abhorrent scene of slavery. Evidence in Jamaica – a considerable number of slaves remained in residence and those who left did not entirely withdraw their labour.
- 6 'Pull' explanation has been gaining ground e.g. Trouillot on Dominica suggests a determined search on the part of ex-slaves for their own advantage.
- 7 Credit attempts to deal with the question of the extent of the movement off estates e.g. ex-slaves 'demonstrated a marked preference for employment on estates which permitted share-cropping and labour-rent practices' (Dominica).

Page 8	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

5 Examine the effects of the development of peasantries on the Caribbean area and the dates of emancipation.

Context of the post emancipation period and the economic and social developments associated with the rise of the peasantry. 'Peasant activity modified the character of the original pure plantation society economy.' Candidates may enlarge on the definition of peasantry.

Effects on economy

- 1 Peasant holdings producing crops and animal products for subsistence and surplus for market became widespread. Over time helped reduce dependence on imported food.
- 2 The marketing arrangements were important, local, middlemen, inter-island, export.
- 3 'Peasants were innovators in the economic life of the community.' In addition to the great quantity and variety of subsistence food and livestock, crops diversifying the economy were introduced or reintroduced into the economy after 1850. Planters adopted the crops later.
- 4 Not all crops successful, coffee in Jamaica low quality.
- 5 Developments in trade, both exports and imports as peasants demanded a range of goods.

Effects on society

- 1 Initiated the formation of modern society – developed villages, markets, built churches and schools, campaigned for improvements, education, communications, markets.
- 2 Cooperatives developed immediately after emancipation, pooled resources to buy land (Jamaica and British Guiana), to drain land (Guyana), built village amenities, and helped each other. Later more formal arrangements (agricultural societies) and late in period Friendly Societies, Banks etc.
- 3 'Peasantry, because of the extent of social investment and self-conscious community building, was a persistent factor both in stability and change inside the West Indian community'. Emancipation in action.
- 4 Rise of middle class associated with land holding.
- 5 Comparatively little government help; poor agricultural skills, lack of fertile land being made available.

Examples

- 1 In Jamaica large numbers of peasants, rising over the period. Crops included bananas, coffee, citrus, cocoa, coconuts.
- 2 Windwards: cocoa, arrowroot, spices, bananas, logwood.
- 3 Haiti: development of small holdings (Petion) often discouraged. Sugar production destroyed; coffee grown, suitable for peasant production.
- 4 Trinidad and British Guiana: both became rice producers mainly produced by Indians who settled. In Trinidad cocoa as a peasant crop.
etc.

Page 9	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

6 Discuss the reasons why the nineteenth century seemed to be a period of crisis for the sugar industry in the British Caribbean.

Expected core would be the impact of legislation, slave trade, emancipation, Sugar Duties, the special issue of Jamaica and the late period of increasing and crippling competition.

- 1 Start of the century: an old industry already with some problems (Jamaica), short term boost with loss of competition from Haiti, but with Cuba, Brazil and East India growing.
- 2 First part of nineteenth century, three 'blows', slave trade abolished, slave emancipation, Sugar Duties Act – all greeted with protest by planters. Emancipation raised labour 'crisis': Sugar Duties Act raised question of profit for British sugar which was backward (esp. Jamaica) in management, technology and indebted and lacking investment. In different ways Barbados, Trinidad and British Guiana overcame labour issues and increased output. Jamaica didn't cope well in 1840s and 1850s (labour, trade, finance, abandoned estates etc.). Late 1840s a critical time.
- 3 Later nineteenth century, problems of price and competition. Selling prices lowered to crisis point in 1880s, and competition intensified (Cuba, Australasia, Philippines, Java etc.). Beet sugar in Europe gave 'unfair' competition (bounties) and Cuba retained slave labour. 1860–70 slump in British Caribbean – loss of 25% in sales. Symbols of crisis:
 - (a) Commissions of enquiry 1882 and 1896. Norman suggested improvement in sugar production, diversifying, expansion of peasantry etc.
 - (b) Declining numbers of estates.
 - (c) Sugar industry in Montserrat, Nevis, St. Vincent and Grenada had collapsed.
- 4 1890 only Antigua, Barbados, British Guiana, St. Lucia and Trinidad derived most revenue from sugar. Exports of sugar – Barbados, St. Kitts, Antigua, British Guiana – all over 90% of all exports, effectively monoculture.

Page 10	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

7 Why were there tensions between different ethnic groups in the Caribbean from 1800 to 1900?

This is a broad topic, accept any reasonable approach. The syllabus reference 'The role of race/racism and colour in post slavery Caribbean societies (discrimination on the basis of class, race, colour)'. Created a persistent and underlying cause of complaints.

Class: structure based on slave period: continued in form of elite dominance. Broad divisions, white, coloured, African-Caribbean, with its assumptions about social and economic roles: emphasised by planter tactics in relation to freed people.

- 1 White dominance in government and plantations led to resentment especially of freed people (Jamaica 1860s) which was part of the social climate.
- 2 From time to time specific situations led to violent outbreaks (Morant Bay, Confederation riots) in which race was one aspect.

Coloured/black friction – coloureds biased towards whites; sense of superiority and so cause of tension (early nineteenth century Haiti).

Issues related to immigrant groups (may be main part of response).

- 1 Portuguese in British Guiana (Trinidad and elsewhere) resentment of freed people, colour and Portuguese economic success in retail trade (exploitation) – Angel Gabriel riots attacks on property.
- 2 Chinese seemed to manage better: adapted to situation though resented being used as plantation labour (false promise).
- 3 Probably the largest element was that of the Indians whose presence was widespread (see below).

Indian Immigrants

- 1 High numbers in Trinidad and British Guiana.
- 2 In French and British colonies mutual feelings of racial superiority caused African Caribbeans and Indians to dislike each other. Indians did the tasks which were deemed to be menial. Culture and skin colour affected relationship.
- 3 Didn't regularly turn to violence (some one on one) but Indians tended to be segregated – villages, lack of schooling etc. No serious competition for jobs until late in the period.
- 4 Indian immigration opposed by groups hostile to sugar planters (black and coloured middle class in Trinidad).
- 5 Of Trinidad 'The essential reality was that Indians came to a society that was hostile to them, a society whose attitudes ranged from fear to contempt to indifference. They reacted defensively.'

Colonial elites: various authors refer to 'divide and rule' attitude: to make use of differences between the groups. Did not wish to see the rise of self-confident and independent communities but to maintain as much of the old social order as possible.

Page 11	Mark Scheme	Syllabus
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – May/June 2008	9697

8 Explain why the policies of other countries, and the power struggles between them, caused problems for Haiti from 1800 to 1825.

The two elements in the question are inter-related but candidates may deal with them separately.

In 1800 still part of French colonies, though Toussaint was acting independently (1801 Constitution). He had ejected Rigaud, a possible rival. Britain had been expelled (1798): Napoleon rising to power. Attack on Spanish part of island.

French intervention 1802–4: Leclerc expedition, involving Rigaud and Petion: Christophe and Dessalines deserted Toussaint. After Toussaint exiled, Haitian leaders deserted French. As French were defeated, Dessalines emerged as leader

1804 Dessalines as Governor-General, then Emperor: Violence. Policies offended mulattoes: Dessalines killed by mutinous mulatto officers of Petion’s army (1806).

Haiti split: civil war ensued: Christophe in North. Petion in South 1812–14 war. Developed separately.

Peace in Europe 1814–15: Haiti (nor separate parts) had not been recognised internationally. Peace Treaty allowed France to recover colonies: unable to retake Haiti. Christophe (King Henry) offered joint resistance pact with Petion. France retained a formal claim on Haiti. There was a de facto acceptance of Haiti via trade – especially with US.

Reunion of Haiti: Petion had difficulty in keeping his Republic together, defeated efforts to create breakaway statelets. Christophe overthrown by internal revolt. After Petion died, the north was invaded by President Boyer who then captured Spanish part of the island.

Diplomatic matters: post 1815: both parts of Haiti favoured anti-slavery movements: spectre of revolution influenced opinions of other governments. France pressed for compensation for former sugar proprietors (1823–5). Haiti agreed to pay and, in return, France agreed to give up all claims on Haiti and a commercial treaty lowered tariff on French goods (1825). By then US merchants dominated trade with Haiti.